



Notice of a public meeting of

Staffing Matters & Urgency Committee

- To:** Councillors Carr (Chair), Aspden (Vice-Chair) and Looker
- Date:** Monday, 3 July 2017
- Time:** 6.00 pm
- Venue:** The Auden Room - Ground Floor, West Offices (G047)

AGENDA

1. Declarations of Interest

At this point in the meeting, Members are asked to declare:

- any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests
- any prejudicial interests or
- any disclosable pecuniary interests

which they may have in respect of business on this agenda.

2. Exclusion of Press and Public

To consider the exclusion of the press and public from the meeting during consideration of the annexes to agenda item 7 (Pension or Exit Discretion) on the grounds that they contain information relating to individuals and the financial affairs of particular persons. This information is classed as exempt under paragraphs 1, 2 and 3 of Schedule 12A to Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972 (as revised by The Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006).

3. Minutes (Pages 1 - 4)

To approve and sign the minutes of the meeting of the Staffing Matters & Urgency Committee held on 5 June 2017.

4. Public Participation

At this point in the meeting members of the public who have registered to speak can do so. The deadline for registering is on **Friday 30 June at 5.00pm**. Members of the public can speak on agenda items or matters within the remit of the committee.

To register to speak please contact the Democracy Officers for the meeting, on the details at the foot of the agenda.

Filming, Recording or Webcasting Meetings

Please note this meeting may be filmed and webcast or audio recorded and that includes any registered public speakers, who have given their permission. This broadcast can be viewed at <http://www.york.gov.uk/webcasts>. or, if recorded, this will be uploaded onto the Council website following the meeting.

Residents are welcome to photograph, film or record Councillors and Officers at all meetings open to the press and public. This includes the use of social media reporting, i.e. tweeting. Anyone wishing to film, record or take photos at any public meeting should contact the Democracy Officers (whose contact details are at the foot of this agenda) in advance of the meeting.

The Council's protocol on Webcasting, Filming & Recording of Meetings ensures that these practices are carried out in a manner both respectful to the conduct of the meeting and all those present. It can be viewed at https://www.york.gov.uk/downloads/file/11406/protocol_for_webcasting_film_and_recording_of_council_meetings_20160809

5. Proposed 12 Month Pilot for the Payment of 'Golden Hellos' and 'Golden Handcuffs' to Social Workers in the Referral & Assessment Team in Children's Services

Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee is asked to approve a 12 month pilot for the payment of 'golden hellos' and 'golden handcuffs' to social workers in the Referral & Assessment team in Children's Services.

6. Changes to Committee and Outside Body Appointments
(Pages 5 - 8)

The report asks Members to agree a number of changes to the membership of Committees and Outside Body Appointments.

7. Pension or Exit Discretion (Pages 9 - 14)

This report advises the Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee of the expenditure associated with pension or exit discretions in accordance with council policy.

8. Urgent Business

Any other business which the Chair considers urgent under the Local Government Act 1972.

Democracy Officers:

Name: Catherine Clarke/Louise Clarke (job-share)

Contact details:

- Telephone – (01904) 551031
- E-mail – catherine.clarke@york.gov.uk / louise.cook@york.gov.uk

For more information about any of the following please contact the Democratic Services Officers responsible for servicing this meeting:

- Registering to speak
- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports and
- For receiving reports in other formats

Contact details are set out above.

This information can be provided in your own language.

我們也用您們的語言提供這個信息 (Cantonese)

এই তথ্য আপনার নিজের ভাষায় দেয়া যেতে পারে। (Bengali)

**Ta informacja może być dostarczona w twoim
własnym języku. (Polish)**

Bu bilgiyi kendi dilinizde almanız mümkündür. (Turkish)

یہ معلومات آپ کی اپنی زبان (بولی) میں بھی مہیا کی جاسکتی ہیں۔ (Urdu)

 (01904) 551550

City of York Council

Committee Minutes

Meeting	Staffing Matters & Urgency Committee
Date	5 June 2017
Present	Councillors Carr (Chair), Aspden (Vice-Chair) and Looker

1. Declarations of Interest

At this point in the meeting, Members were asked to declare if they had any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests or any prejudicial or disclosable pecuniary interests that they might have had in the business on the agenda. None were declared.

2. Exclusion of Press and Public

Resolved: That the press and public be excluded from the meeting during the consideration of annexes to Agenda Items 5 & 6 on the grounds that they contained information relating to individuals and the financial affairs of particular persons. This information is classed as exempt under Paragraphs 1, 2 and 3 of Schedule 12A to Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972 (as revised by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006).

3. Minutes

Resolved: That the minutes of the Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee held on 8 May 2017 be approved and then signed by the Chair as a correct record.

4. Public Participation

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

5. Pension or Exit Discretion

Members considered a report which detailed expenditure associated with a pension or exit discretion in accordance with Council policy.

The background and detailed case surrounding the proposal was contained in the business case attached as a confidential annexe to the report.

Resolved: That the expenditure associated with the proposed pension or exit discretion, as detailed in Annex A of the report, be approved.

Reason: In order to provide an overview of expenditure and to consider whether the Council should exercise its discretionary powers to make enhancements.

6. Redundancy

Members considered a report which detailed expenditure associated with the proposed dismissal of an employee on the grounds of redundancy.

The background and detailed case surrounding the proposal was contained in the business case attached as a confidential annexe to the report.

Resolved: That the expenditure associated with the proposed dismissal of the employee on the grounds of redundancy detailed in Annex A, be noted.

Reason: In order to provide an overview of the expenditure

7. Urgent Business

Resolved: That item 8 be considered as an urgent item, in order to rectify an administrative error.

Reason: In order to make appropriate appointments to the Council's Committees for the current municipal year.

8. Changes to Committee Appointments

Members noted that at the Annual Council meeting on 25 May 2017, appointments were made to Committees, Sub-Committees and Outside Bodies for the 2017/18 municipal year and that it was now necessary to make an urgent change, in order to rectify an administrative error.

Members agreed that Staffing Matters & Urgency Committee had the authority to deal with any changes or appointments to Committees and Outside Bodies, and noted the following amendments to the membership of the Economy & Place Policy Development Committee:

- To appoint Cllr Cullwick to replace Cllr Mason as a member of the Committee; and
- To appoint Cllr Hunter to replace Cllr Cullwick as a substitute representative.

Resolved: That the above changes to the Economy & Place Policy Development Committee, be agreed.

Reason: In order to make appropriate appointments to the Council's Committees for the current municipal year.

Cllr Carr, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.30pm and finished at 5.37pm].

This page is intentionally left blank



Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee**3 July 2017**

Report of the Corporate Director of Children, Education & Communities

Proposed Pilot for the Payment of ‘Golden Hellos’ and ‘Golden Handcuffs’ to Social Workers in the Referral & Assessment Team in Children’s Services for a 12 month pilot period.**Summary**

1. Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee is asked to approve a 12 month pilot for the payment of ‘golden hellos’ and ‘golden handcuffs’ to social workers in the Referral & Assessment team in Children’s Services.
2. The reason for this proposal is to attract new staff to come and work in this service and retain existing staff. There are regional and national shortages of staff to work in these roles and the cost of providing short term cover through agency workers causes a significant financial pressure for the service.
3. The paper will provide background details of the number of vacant posts in the Referral & Assessment team; the cost of agency workers providing cover; the recruitment activity associated with attracting candidates to the vacancies; and information about the regional and national context.

Background

4. Since at least October 2015 the Referral & Assessment (R&A) Social Work team has experienced significant recruitment difficulties.
5. The Referral and Assessment Service is the Front Door for all referrals into children’s social care (CSC). This outward facing service provides the first response to children in need of additional services but also, and critically, to those who may be at significant risk of harm. It is a highly pressured environment.

6. The service is also the gateway to all other services provided by children's social care. The quality and timeliness of responses in R&A has a direct impact on the quality of service provision across CSC.
7. The service consists of 3 teams providing a duty system on a three week rota basis. The teams also complete the single assessment (up to 45 days) which determines which (if any) service will be provided to children and families.
8. Out of an establishment team of 18 full time equivalents, there are currently 5 vacancies. Between October 2015 and December 2016, the service has gone out to recruit on four occasions, at a total cost of £7,800, these have not resulted in successful appointments to roles in the R&A team.
9. Various solutions to address the recruitment challenges facing the department in attracting and retaining qualified social workers, specifically in the R&A specialist team have been considered. We have established that our pay and grading of these posts is not significantly out of line with others across the region, however most other authorities have a mechanism to respond to the recruitment challenges.

Proposal

10. The department wishes to proceed with the following proposals, on a pilot basis for a 12 month period:

Golden Hello

11. To make a 'golden hello' payment to all new starters taking up social work positions in the Referral & Assessment team.
12. It is proposed to make a payment of £2500 (pro-rata for part time) payable in a lump sum, for ease of administration, as a one off payment on the successful completion of the probationary period.
13. The payment will be subject to the normal deductions i.e tax, national insurance & pension contributions.
14. Should a member of staff in receipt of the payment leave the authority within one year of the agreement, the payment will be recovered in full.
15. Should a member of staff in receipt of the payment leave within two years of the agreement, 50% of the payment will be recovered.

16. This recovery approach is in keeping with other arrangements in place for employees such as a learning agreement.

Golden Handcuff

17. To make a 'golden handcuff' payment to all current staff in the referral & assessment team of £2500 (pro-rata for part time) payable in a one off lump sum payment. This will be paid via the payroll system.

18. Should a member of staff leave the local authority, the same recovery terms will apply to the handcuff payment as the 'golden hello'.

Consultation and Considerations

19. There has been early discussion with the Trade Unions and they are keen to consider creative approaches to address the recruitment challenges in this area. Should this be agreed, further discussion will take place with trade union colleagues and appropriate communication with staff.

Analysis

National picture

20. There is a national shortage of experienced social workers. It has become increasingly difficult to recruit to the most pressured social work positions. Many local authorities have revised their pay and conditions, or offered a golden handshake/golden hello, to attract to these positions.

Golden Hello & Golden Handcuff Payments

21. A "golden hello" is an amount paid to an employee as an inducement to take up employment with a particular employer.

22. A "Golden Handcuff" is an amount paid to existing employees as a means of holding on to key employees and increasing employee retention rates.

23. There is the expectation, in the application of either payment, that the employ would remain an employee for a specified period of time.

24. Payments are normally made in the form of a cash lump sum. Any payment should be subject to tax and national insurance under the employer's PAYE scheme.

25. There are a variety of pay arrangements across the region that make use of such payments, for example;

Barnsley A one off golden hello payment of £2.5k for new social work staff
A one off payment of £1.5k to existing social work staff

Rotherham Payments are made to all social work staff, ranging from £2177 for a social worker on ASYE programme up to £3254 for a Team Leader

Sheffield A market supplement of £4k to Team Leaders

26. A proposal to make a payment of £2500 is in keeping with similar arrangements in place across the region

Recruitment Activity

27. Between October 2015 and December 2016 the service has gone out to recruit on four occasions at a cost of £7,800.

28. Over this period five newly qualified social workers and three experienced social workers were offered positions within R & A.

29. Of the five NQSWs, two declined the offer stating that they were offered opportunities of employment in the Local Authority where they had completed their final social work placement. The three who accepted remain within the R & A Service. Of the three more experienced social workers offered a permanent contract only one accepted the role (only to leave for agency work a few months later).

30. No suitable experienced social workers were identified during the third recruitment episode.

Cost of agency

31. At present, up to 5 posts are being covered using agency staffing at considerable additional cost. The overspend would increase to over

£150k if these posts continue to be filled by agency staff for the remainder of the year.

32. Taking into account all of the factors listed above, the implications of recruiting in the traditional way could result in the continued reliance on agency workers, pressure on existing staff due to staff turnover and instability in a pressurised environment.

Council Plan

33. Outcomes achieved by the activities covered in this report help us to deliver priorities in the Council Plan 2015-19 in support of ‘A prosperous city for all’ ensuring the council supports the delivery of statutory services to children and families in the City.

Implications

Financial

34. The R&A team is currently overspending its staffing budget significantly due to the need to employ agency staff. Each post covered by an agency appointment, rather than a permanent employee, incurs an average additional cost of c£600 per week. Additional costs in excess of the team’s budget for the first three months of 2017/18 already total £36k, and are projected to reach £156k if there is no improvement in the recruitment situation. This excludes the costs (advertising etc.) of any additional recruitment campaigns.
35. The initial up front cost of the pilot in 2017/18 is estimated at £59k for golden handcuff payments to 13 existing staff, and golden hello payments to recruit to 5 vacant posts currently covered by agency staff. There is no existing budget available to fund these costs. However, if the pilot is successful and all posts are filled by permanent staff by the end of September, then the saving against the current projected staffing overspend of £156k would be £19k. And if sustained, further significant savings against current expenditure levels would also be delivered for future years.
36. Members should note that if the pilot is not successful, and some or all of the current vacancies remain covered by agency staff, then the projected overspend for 2017/18 could increase by up to £43k (the cost of the golden handcuffs for existing staff).

37. In light of the expenditure pressures highlighted in the report, and regardless of any decision that Members may make, the director will look to take mitigating actions elsewhere in CEC directorate budgets over the remainder of the year to try and offset the projected overspends being experienced within the R&A team.

Human Resources

38. Current pay proposals for the council are relatively limiting in responding to acute recruitment and retention difficulties. These proposals are in response to specific challenges in a particular specialist area and there is substantial evidence to support the need to make an enhanced payment.

39. Within current policy there are no means of addressing this with pay.

40. It is proposed that this arrangement is a pilot to determine whether the payment has a positive impact on alleviating the recruitment and retention difficulties. It is recommended that the activity is reviewed on a regular basis throughout the pilot, with a detailed report at the end of the 12 month period to evaluate and make any recommendations to inform future pay policy.

41. This proposal will be supported by a comprehensive campaign to promote Children's social work in York and will be part of the holistic approach to ensure a sustainable Children's social work workforce. A procurement process has been undertaken and Community Care have been appointed to support with the delivery of the campaign.

42. This approach will complement the proposal to make enhanced payments to a specific group of staff and promote York as a place to develop and grow as a Children's social worker

43. This proposal may set a precedent for other social work teams or specialist roles, however this is a pilot and will determine any future policy decision.

Legal

44. The regional and national shortage of staff is strong justification for making the proposed payments and any risk would be objectively justifiable on sound business reasons.

Information Technology (IT)

45. There are no IT implications for CYC arising from this report.

Property

46. There are no property implications.

Other

47. There are no equalities or crime and disorder implications arising from this report.

Risk Management

48. It is proposed that this arrangement is a pilot to determine whether the payment has a positive impact on alleviating the recruitment and retention difficulties in a specific social work team.

49. It is essential that we have a fully staffed R&A service, with a mixture of experienced and recently qualified social workers. To date we have utilised agency staff to cover these positions however this impacts both on the consistency of social work and our ability to move the service forward in the direction agreed and articulated in the Vision for CSC. It is also an expensive option.

50. Should the proposal not be approved, there is a risk that agency costs will continue to put a pressure on budgets and potentially increase.

Recommendations

51. Staffing Matters & Urgency Committee is asked to agree to the payment of 'golden hellos' and 'golden handcuffs' to social workers in the Referral & Assessment team in Children's Services for a 12 month pilot period.

Reason: To support the recruitment and retention of social work staff to stabilise the R&A team.

Contact Details

Author:	Chief Officer Responsible for the report:		
Mark Bennett Head of HR & OD Tel No.01904 554518	Jon Stonehouse, Corporate Director of Children, Education and Communities		
Claire Waind HR Manager Human Resources Tel No. 01904 554519	Report approved	✓	Date 22/06/17
Specialist Implications Officer(s)			
Financial: Richard Hartle, Head of Finance, 01904 554225 Human Resources: Claire Waind, HR Manager, 01904 554519 Legal: Peter Cairns, Senior Solicitor, 01904 551095			
Wards Affected:			All
For further information please contact the author of the report			

Background Papers

None

Annexes

None

Abbreviations used in report

CSC Children's Social Care

CEC Children, Education and Communities (Directorate)

CYC City of York Council

R&A Referral & Assessment



Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee**3 July 2017**

Report of the Assistant Director - Legal and Governance

Changes to Committee and Outside Body Appointments**Summary**

1. At the Annual Council meeting on 26 May 2017, appointments were made to Committees, Sub-Committees and Outside Bodies for the 2017/18 municipal year. There are now a number of further changes to the membership of Committee's and Outside Bodies, as set out below.

Background

2. The Council makes appointments at its Annual Meeting, to Committees and Outside Bodies. As the Staffing Matters & Urgency Committee has authority to deal with any changes or appointments to those Committees and Outside Bodies, in year, the following are put forward for consideration;

Area Planning Sub Committee

To appoint Cllr Pavlovic as Labour substitute on this committee

Audit and Governance Committee

To appoint Cllr Looker as Labour substitute on this committee

Children Education and Communities Policy and Scrutiny Committee

To appoint Cllr Crawshaw to replace Cllr Wells on this committee

To appoint Cllr Wells as Labour substitute on this committee

Corporate Appeals Panel

To appoint Cllr Funnell as Labour substitute on this committee

Customer and Corporate Services Scrutiny Management Committee

To appoint Cllr Crisp as Labour substitute on this committee

Economy and Place Policy Development Committee

To appoint Cllr Williams as Labour substitute on this committee

Economy and Place Scrutiny Committee

To appoint Cllr Flinders as Labour substitute on this committee

Education Appeals Panel

To appoint Cllr Crawshaw as Labour substitute on this committee

Equality Advisory Group

To appoint Cllr Crisp as Labour substitute on this committee

Health, Housing and Adult Social Care Policy and Scrutiny Committee

To appoint Cllr Pavlovic to replace Cllr S Barnes on this committee.

To appoint Cllr Derbyshire as Labour substitute on this committee

Health and Wellbeing Board

To appoint Cllr S Barnes as Labour substitute on this committee

Housing Appeals Panel

To appoint Cllr Derbyshire as Labour substitute on this committee

Joint Standards Committee

To appoint Cllr Shepherd as Labour substitute on this committee

Local Plan Working Group

To appoint Cllr D Myers as Labour substitute on this committee

Planning Committee

To appoint Cllr Crawshaw as Labour substitute on this committee

Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee

To appoint Cllr S Barnes as Labour substitute on this committee

North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Authority

To appoint Cllr Funnell as Labour substitute on this body.

York Central Community Forum

To appoint Cllr Crawshaw to York Central Community Forum to fill the vacancy.

Terry's Community Forum

Cllr Crawshaw to replace former Cllr Gunnell on Terry's Community Forum.

Micklegate York Charitable Trust

Cllr Crawshaw to replace former Cllr Gunnell on Micklegate York Charitable Trust.

Consultation

3. Normal processes to consult the relevant political Group have been applied to ensure the Group nominate the Members of their choice. No other consultation is specifically required in this instance.

Options

4. There are no alternative options available as this is simply for the Groups concerned to nominate appropriate candidates to either replace the Member concerned or to fill the position that has become available.

Council Plan

5. Maintaining an appropriate decision making and scrutiny structure and appointees to that contribute to the Council delivering its core priorities set out in the current Council Plan, effectively.

Implications

6. There are no known implications in relation to the following in terms of dealing with the specific matter before Members:
 - Financial
 - Human Resources (HR)
 - Equalities
 - Crime and Disorder
 - Property
 - Other

Legal Implications

7. The Council is statutorily obliged to make appointments to committees, advisory committees, Sub Committees and certain other prescribed bodies in accordance with the political balance rules. These rules may only be waived where no Member votes against the proposal.

Risk Management

8. In compliance with the Council's risk management strategy, there are no known risks associated with the recommendation in this report.

Recommendations

- 9. Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee is asked to agree the changes to Committees and outside body membership as outlined in paragraph 2 of the report.

Reason: In order to make appropriate appointments to the Council's Committees and Outside Bodies for the current municipal year.

Author:

Dawn Steel
Head of Civic and Democratic Services
Tel: (01904) 551030

Chief Officer Responsible for the report:

Andy Docherty
Assistant Director, Legal and Governance

Report

Date June 2017

Specialist Implications Officers

Not applicable

Wards Affected: All

All

For further information please contact the author of the report

Background Papers

None

Annexes

None



Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee**3 July 2017**

Report of the Director of Corporate and Customer Services

Pension or Exit Discretion**Summary**

1. This report advises the Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee of the expenditure associated with pension or exit discretions in accordance with council policy.

Background

2. The background and detailed case surrounding the proposal is contained in the individual business case attached as a confidential annex to this report.

Consultation

3. The proposed pension or exit discretion has been subject to consultation in accordance with the Council's statutory obligations.

Options

4. The Committee has the power within the Council's procedures to approve discretionary enhancements to redundancy and/or pension payments. The Committee does not have the power to make lower payments. By law the decisions as to whether or not to make an employee redundant rests with the Chief Executive or Officers nominated by her.

Analysis

5. The analysis of the proposal can be found in the attached business case.

Council Plan

6. Whilst the actions being proposed in the report are not material to the Council Plan they are consistent with the required outcomes of the Workforce Strategy.

Implications

- 7. The implications of each proposal can be found in the attached business case.

Risk Management

- 8. The specific risks associated with the proposal and how they can be mitigated are contained in the business case. In summary, the risks associated with the recommended option are financial, legal, operational and reputational.

Recommendations

- 9. The Staffing Matters and Urgency Committee is asked to consider the proposal as detailed in the annex.

Reason: In order to provide an overview of expenditure and to consider whether the Council should exercise its discretionary powers to make enhancements.

Contact Details

Author:

Mark Bennett
Head of Human Resources
01904 554518

Chief Officer Responsible for the report:

Ian Floyd
Director of Corporate and Customer Services

Report Approved



Date 20 June 2017

Specialist Implications Officer(s):

Wards Affected:

All



For further information please contact the author of the report

Background Papers

None

Annexes

Annex A – Confidential Business Case

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2, 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank